LMI in the GTA
Getting Behind the Numbers

Research Presentation
Intergovernmental Committee for Economic & Labour Force Development
Tom Zizys
September 2015
Outline of presentation

- Description of assignment
- Main findings
- Some issues about labour market data
- Recommendations
ASSIGNMENT

• How is LMI in the GTA produced, coordinated and used
• Recommend improvements

APPROACH

• Literature review
• Reviewed and assessed websites
• Interviews with key informants
What is LMI?

- Anything that helps a person to understand the labour market or to make a decision in relation to the labour market
  - Can be data or explanation
  - Can be quantitative or qualitative
  - Can be descriptive or analytical
Main findings

• Overall, the LMI is relatively plentiful and generally good
• There is a tendency to emphasize the data
• Of course there are shortfalls in the data
• The real gap is in understanding the data
• Do not see much point in proposing more data when we hardly use the data we have
• Could certainly use more LMI to understand the demand side
Available data

STATISTICS CANADA PRIMARY DATA
• National Household Survey
• Labour Market Survey
• Survey of Employment, Payrolls and Hours
• Canadian Business Counts
• Job Vacancy Statistics

EMPLOYMENT AND SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT CANADA
• Canadian Occupational Projection System
Entry-point websites

Toronto Employment and Labour Market Information (TELMI)

Working in Peel Halton

Job Bank (federal government)

Labour Market Information – MTCU

Routes TO. Employment

Routes TO. Trades

Career Cruising
Other websites of relevance

• Municipal governments
• Workforce development boards
• Sites for labour market studies
• Job banks/job boards
• Other sources
Is the LMI fit for purpose?

• Great tendency to focus the question on the data component of LMI
• My own ambivalence about the value of data
• What does it mean when we seek to understand the data?
  ➢ Trends
  ➢ What measurement is important
  ➢ What is the context
The complex of ideas which defines an era, which conditions all thought and action

Leo Frobenius (1873-1938)
German ethnologist and archeologist
What’s our “paideuma”?

• Data
• Immediacy
  ✤ What gets measured gets valued
  ✤ Short time horizon
Percent unemployed for more than half a year, September 2014 to August 2015
Percent unemployed for more than half a year, Previous 5 years: 2010 to 2014
Percent unemployed for more than half a year, Previous 8 years: 2006 to 2014

![Graph showing the percentage of unemployed individuals for more than half a year from 2006 to 2014. The graph indicates a notable increase in unemployment between 2009 and 2010, followed by a decline.](image-url)
What gets measured: Head Start

• Head Start – U.S. Pre-school program
• Early successes evaporate over time
• Parents very supportive

• Further tracking decades later showed:
  ▶ Fewer learning disabilities
  ▶ More high school completions
  ▶ Fewer arrests
  ▶ Less smoking and drug use
### What gets measured

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUPPLY SIDE</th>
<th>DEMAND SIDE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Age</td>
<td>• Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Gender</td>
<td>• Number of employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Canadian-born/immigrant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Visible minority</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Employment income</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Occupation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Industry</td>
<td><em>Nothing that provides insights regarding quality of employment or outcomes</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Employment income, full-time full-year employees, retail sales clerks, Ontario 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education Level</th>
<th>Average Income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No certificate</td>
<td>$32,894</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school</td>
<td>$36,640</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apprenticeship</td>
<td>$37,601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College</td>
<td>$39,813</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor's</td>
<td>$49,229</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Employment income, full-time full-year employees, males and females, retail sales clerks, Ontario 2010

No certificate: Males $39,670, Females $25,000
High school: Males $39,670, Females $25,000
Apprenticeship: Males $38,858, Females $25,000
College: Males $38,858, Females $25,000
Bachelor's: Males $38,858, Females $25,000
Gender wage gap

• “The existence of the gender wage gap can be explained by differences in occupations, job tenure, hours worked per week, and so on”

• Bliss v. The Attorney-General of Canada (1979): Supreme Court held that pregnant woman was not discriminated against for being denied access to UI sickness benefits

• “If s. 46 treats unemployed pregnant women differently from other unemployed persons, be they male or female, it is, it seems to me, because they are pregnant and not because they are women.”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>MALES</th>
<th>FEMALES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>100%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Change in employment income, by MtF and FtM transitions

Kristen Shilt, *Just One of the Guys? Transgender Men and the Persistence of Gender Inequality*, 2010
STATCAN LABOUR FORCE SURVEY

- Sample of 54,000 households in Canada
- 100,000 individuals
- For Ontario, @ 36,600 residents
- Consider unemployed: 560,000
- Relative standard error: 2.5%
- Two-thirds of the time, accurate within 2.5%, and 95% of the time, accurate within 5%
No change in unemployed number

Within margin of error
“Unemployment increasing”

“Sixth month of jobless decline, recovery underway”

Margin of error (3)
Oftentimes, the change in the monthly number of employed reported by the Labour Force Survey is smaller than the margin of error.
"Meaningless statistics were up one-point-five per cent this month over last month."
Recommendations

1. Create a GTA LMI table
2. Collectively acquire customized data and analysis
3. Consider common dashboard indicators
4. Develop specific demand-side LMI gathering tools
5. Develop deeper, qualitative, demand-side LMI
6. Promote a single, super LMI portal? No